

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 **United States District Court**
9 **Central District of California**
10

11 ARSLAN BHATTI,

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 ROGER GOLDMAN; TELECOM DEBT
15 COLLECTION AND CREDIT

16 INFORMATION AGENCY; BANKAI

17 GROUP, INC.; BANKIM

18 BRAHMBHATT; and DOES 1–10,

19 inclusive,

20 Defendants.

Case No. 2:14-cv-03226-ODW(RZx)

**ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFF’S
EX PARTE APPLICATION FOR
ORDER AUTHORIZING SERVICE
OF PROCESS ON DEFENDANTS
PURSUANT TO FEDERAL RULE
OF CIVIL PROCEDURE 4(f)(3) [16]**

21 Before the Court is Plaintiff Arslan Bhatti’s *Ex Parte* Application for Order
22 Authorizing Service of Process on Defendants Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil
23 Procedure 4(f)(3). (ECF No. 16.) Bhatti is seeking approval from this Court to serve
24 the Summons and Complaint upon Defendants Roger Goldman and Telecom Debt
25 Collection and Credit Information Agency (“TDCCIA”) via email.

26 The Ninth Circuit has endorsed service via email under Rule 4(f)(3) as long as a
27 court balances “the limitations of email service against its benefits” in a particular
28 case. *Rio Props., Inc. v. Rio. Int’l Interlink*, 284 F.3d 1007, 1018 (9th Cir. 2002). The

1 key inquiry is whether the method of service is reasonably calculated under the
2 circumstances to apprise the defendant of the pendency of the action. *Id.* at 1019.

3 Here, the Court finds that email service on Goldman and TDCCIA is
4 appropriate. Bhatti has demonstrated due diligence in trying to locate a physical
5 address for both Goldman and TDCCIA to no avail. (Bhatti Decl. ¶¶ 11–12; Whittet
6 Decl. ¶¶ 4, 9–10.) Moreover, Bhatti has also made a showing that email is the method
7 of service most likely to reach the defendant. Goldman has responded to emails sent
8 by Bhatti and his attorney. (*See* Bhatti Decl. ¶ 7; Exs. 2–3.) TDCCIA is a web-based
9 debt-collection business and the only means of contacting individuals at TDCCIA is
10 via the website—www.tdcccia.com—and the email addresses listed on the website.
11 (*E.g., id.* ¶¶ 21–23.)

12 Accordingly, the Court **GRANTS** Bhatti's *Ex Parte* Application for leave to
13 serve the Summons and Complaint on Goldman and TDCCIA via email. (ECF
14 No. 16.) Bhatti shall serve the Summons and Complaint on Goldman and TDCCIA
15 **by certified email** at all of the following email addresses: rogergoldman@tdcccia.com,
16 rogergoldman10@gmail.com, and sharonmgilad@gmail.com. Along with the
17 Summons and Complaint, Bhatti shall also serve this Order at the above listed email
18 addresses. Bhatti's proof of service shall include copies of the emails and any
19 tracking information that may be available to confirm receipt.

20 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

21
22 June 3, 2014

23
24 
25 **OTIS D. WRIGHT, II**
26 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE**
27
28